The Prehistory of Mathematical Structuralism

Edited by

ERICH H. RECK AND GEORG SCHIEMER

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Oxford University Press 2020

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

This is an open access publication distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial No Derivatives 4.0 International license (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0), a copy of which is available at http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/. For any use not expressly allowed in the CC BY-NC-ND license terms, please contact the publisher.

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
ISBN 978–0–19–064122–1

1 3 5 7 9 8 6 4 2

Printed by Integrated Books International, United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgments vii
About the Contributors ix

1. Introduction and Overview 1
Erich H. Reck and Georg Schiemer

I. MATHEMATICAL DEVELOPMENTS

2. Grassmann's Concept Structuralism 21
Paola Cantù

3. Dedekind's Mathematical Structuralism: From Galois Theory to Numbers, Sets, and Functions 59
José Ferreirós and Erich H. Reck

4. Pasch's Empiricism as Methodological Structuralism 88
Dirk Schlimm

5. Transfer Principles, Klein's Erlangen Program, and Methodological Structuralism 106
Georg Schiemer

6. The Ways of Hilbert's Axiomatics: Structural and Formal 142
Wilfried Sieg

7. Noether as Mathematical Structuralist 166
Audrey Yap

8. The Functional Role of Structures in Bourbaki 187
Gerhard Heinzmann and Jean Petitot

9. Saunders Mac Lane: From *Principia Mathematica* through Göttingen to the Working Theory of Structures 215
Colin McLarty

II. LOGICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL REFLECTIONS

10. Logic of Relations and Diagrammatic Reasoning: Structuralist Elements in the Work of Charles Sanders Peirce 241
Jessica Carter

11. Poincaré and the Prehistory of Mathematical Structuralism 273
Janet Folina

12. "If Numbers Are to Be Anything At All, They Must Be Intrinsically Something": Bertrand Russell and Mathematical Structuralism 303
Jeremy Heis

13. Cassirer's Reception of Dedekind and the Structuralist Transformation of Mathematics 329
Erich H. Reck

14. Methodological Frames: Paul Bernays, Mathematical Structuralism, and Proof Theory 352
Wilfried Sieg

15. Carnap's Structuralist Thesis 383
Georg Schiemer

16. Explication as Elimination: W. V. Quine and Mathematical Structuralism 421
Sean Morris

Name Index 443
Subject Index 447

About the Contributors

Paola Cantù is a CNRS tenured researcher affiliated with the Centre Gilles Gaston Granger at Aix-Marseille Université. She has published on the epistemology of the Peano School, on Gödel's philosophy, on Bolzano, on Veronese's infinitesimals, and on argumentation theory.

Jessica Carter is Associate Professor at the Department of Mathematics and Computer Science at the University of Southern Denmark. Her research combines the philosophy of mathematics with the history and contemporary "practice" of mathematics. She has in particular contributed to two areas, namely visual thinking and structuralism in mathematics. She is also among the founders of the Association for the Philosophy of Mathematical Practice.

José Ferreirós is Professor of Logic and Philosophy of Science at the University of Seville in Spain. He is the author of *Labyrinth of Thought: A History of Set Theory and Its Role in Modern Mathematics* (1999) and of *Mathematical Knowledge and the Interplay of Practices* (2015).

Janet Folina is Professor of Philosophy at Macalester College. She is the author of *Poincaré and the Philosophy of Mathematics* (1992). Her current research interests include the philosophy of mathematics of the 19th and 20th centuries, and the concept of proof in mathematics.

Gerhard Heinzmann is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Lorraine in Nancy and founder of the history of science and philosophy laboratory Archives Henri Poincaré. He is an expert on the mathematical and philosophical work of Poincaré and has published extensively on Poincaré, Wittgenstein, and Cavaillès, among others. He is co-editor of *The Age of Alternative Logics: Assessing Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics Today* (2006) and of *Freedom in Mathematics* (2016).

Jeremy Heis is Associate Professor at the Department of Logic and Philosophy Science at the University of California, Irvine. His research focuses on Kant's philosophy of mathematics and logic, neo-Kantianism (especially Ernst Cassirer), and early analytic philosophy. He also has more general interests in the history and philosophy of mathematics and logic.

Colin McLarty is Truman P. Handy Professor of Intellectual Philosophy and Professor of Mathematics at Case Western Reserve University. His research focuses on logic, the history and philosophy of mathematics, and on structural foundations for mathematics in category theory. He is the author of *Elementary Categories, Elementary Toposes* (1992).

Sean Morris is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Metropolitan State University of Denver. His research focuses on the history of analytic philosophy and logic. He is particularly interested in the interaction of technical developments in mathematics and the special sciences with philosophy. He is the author of *Quine, New Foundations, and the Philosophy of Set Theory* (2018).

Jean Petitot was Full Professor at the Mathematical Center of the School for Advanced Studies in Social Sciences (EHESS) in Paris and former director of the Research Center in Applied Epistemology (CREA) at the École Polytechnique. His main research interests concern the epistemology of mathematics and neurocognitive models. He is the author of over 300 research articles and eight books, including *Elements of Neurogeometry: Functional Architectures of Vision* (2017).

Erich H. Reck is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Riverside. His main research interests lie in the philosophy of mathematics, the history and philosophy of logic, and the history of 19th/20th-century philosophy. He is the editor of several collections of articles, beginning with *From Frege to Wittgenstein: Perspectives on Early Analytic Philosophy* (2002), and most recently *Logic, Philosophy of Mathematics and their History: Essays in Honor of W.W. Tait* (2018). He has also published a number of articles on Dedekind, Frege, Carnap, Wittgenstein, and Cassirer.

Georg Schiemer is Associate Professor at the Department of Philosophy at the University of Vienna as well as external fellow at the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy at Ludwig Maximilian University Munich. He is also principal investigator of the project "The Roots of Mathematical Structuralism" funded by an European Research Council Starting Grant (2017–2022). His research focuses on the history and philosophy of mathematics and early analytic philosophy. He is also interested in the history and philosophy of logic and formal philosophy of science.

Dirk Schlimm is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy and Associate Member in the School of Computer Science at McGill University. He is also an External Member of the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy (MCMP), Ludwig Maximilian University Munich. His research interests fall in the areas of history and philosophy of mathematics and science, epistemology, and cognitive science. In particular, he is interested in the developments in the 19th and early 20th centuries that led to the emergence of modern mathematics and logic, and in systematic investigations regarding axiomatics, the use of notation, analogical reasoning, concept formation, and theory development.

Wilfried Sieg is the Patrick Suppes Professor of Philosophy at Carnegie Mellon University. He received his Ph.D. from Stanford University in 1977. From 1977 to 1985, he was Assistant and Associate Professor at Columbia University. In 1985, he joined the Carnegie Mellon faculty as a founding member of the University's Philosophy Department and served as its head from 1994 to 2005. He is internationally known for mathematical work in proof theory, historical work on modern logic and mathematics, and philosophical essays on the nature of mathematics. He is the author of *Hilbert's Programs and*

Beyond (2013 and 2019); he edited and co-edited a number of volumes including *David Hilbert's Lectures on the Foundations of Arithmetic and Logic* (2013). Sieg is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

Audrey Yap is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Victoria, in British Columbia. Her primary research areas are the history and philosophy of mathematics and logic, as well as feminist epistemology. She is currently on the Association for Symbolic Logic Committee for Logic Education and a board member of the Philosophy of Mathematics Association.